

Bradford v. Maryland State Board of Education - Timeline

DATE	HEADLINE	TEXT	MEDIA & LINKS
1983	Court Finds Constitution Guarantees Right to Thorough and Efficient Education	In <i>Hornbeck v. Somerset Co.</i> , a lawsuit brought by Maryland’s school systems with the lowest wealth (including Baltimore City), the Maryland Court of Appeals ruled that the Constitution guarantees a thorough and efficient education, meaning one that is adequate by contemporary educational standards. However, this requirement does not guarantee equal funding for each school district.	David W. Hornbeck et al. v. Somerset County Board of Education et al.
1994	ACLU Files Lawsuit Against Maryland State Board of Education	ACLU files <i>Bradford v. Maryland State Board of Education</i> case on behalf of Baltimore parents and children, based on an education rights claim under Maryland’s Constitution. The <i>Bradford</i> case remains under the authority of the state Circuit Court for Baltimore City.	Complaint Press Release: ACLU Files Lawsuit Against Maryland State Board of Education
1996	Victory for the Children of Baltimore City – Court Confirms State’s Obligation to Provide Adequate Public Education	Baltimore City Circuit Court Judge Joseph Kaplan rules that the Maryland constitution guarantees an “adequate” education and that the city’s school children were not receiving a constitutionally adequate education.	Order A Brief History: Bradford v. Maryland State Board of Education
1996	Bradford Plaintiffs & State of Maryland Sign Legal Consent Decree	<i>Bradford</i> plaintiffs and the State of Maryland enter a consent decree. The Consent Decree established a “City-State Partnership” embodied in the New Board of School Commissioners jointly appointed by the Governor and the Mayor to manage the schools. It also provided additional funds for the schools and permitted the Board and <i>Bradford</i> plaintiffs to return to Court to seek additional funds based on an expert interim evaluation of the schools’ progress.	Bradford Consent Decree

1997	Consent Decree Goes into Effect	State legislation implementing the consent decree passes and goes into effect; this brings \$230 million for Baltimore City Public Schools (BCPSS) over the next 5 years, and changes to Board governance.	A Brief History: Bradford v. Maryland State Board of Education
1999	State Establishes Education Commission	State leaders establish “Thornton” Commission on Education Finance, Equity & Excellence, charged with developing recommendations to ensure state’s education funding formula is both adequate and equitable for school districts statewide.	Commission on Education Finance, Equity, & Excellence
2000	Bradford Plaintiffs Request Funding for Plan to Address School Needs	As required by the Consent Decree, an independent expert (Metis Associates), jointly selected by State and Board assessed BCPSS performance. The interim Metis Report recommended increased funding for BCPSS. The <i>Bradford</i> Plaintiffs and the Baltimore City Board of School Commissioners return to court, asking that an additional \$49.7 million “Remedy Plan” be funded to bring critical resources and staff to Baltimore schools.	Filing
2000	Judge Holds that More Funding is Needed	Judge Kaplan rules for the plaintiffs, holding that an additional \$2,000 to \$2,600 per student, in addition to all other funding streams, is necessary, and declares that the State should fund the necessary amount.	Opinion, Order
2002	Bridge to Excellence Passes to Increase State Education Funding	The General Assembly passes the Bridge to Excellence in Public Schools Act, based on the "Thornton" Commission's recommendation. The law includes \$1.3 billion increase in statewide education funding, with \$260 million to go to BCPSS, phased in over an 8-year period.	Press Release – ACLU of Maryland Applauds Education Funding Increase; Calls It Important Step Toward Educational Adequacy for Schoolchildren
2002	Court Approves Judicial Oversight	<i>Bradford</i> Plaintiffs and the Baltimore City Board of School Commissioners request continued judicial oversight of the <i>Bradford</i> case, beyond the original 5-year consent decree. The Court agrees.	Filing, Opinion, Order
2004	Judge Joseph Kaplan	In 2004, well before full phase-in of the constitutionally required Thornton funding, a \$58 million BCPSS deficit	Memorandum, Motion, Opinion, Opinion (cont.), Order

	<p>Rules in Favor of the students of Baltimore City Public School System</p>	<p>emerged that forced increases in class sizes, the elimination of summer school, and a reduction in supportive services such as guidance counselors. As a result, <i>Bradford</i> Plaintiffs moved for further declaratory relief.</p> <p>The Circuit Court found that the State still had not provided the \$2,000 to \$2,600 per pupil the Court had found necessary in 2000 and that the State had unlawfully underfunded BCPSS by an amount ranging from \$439.35 million to \$834.68 million in the aggregate for FY 2001, 2002, 2003, and 2004. It held that BCPSS would not be sufficiently funded, unless the State provided at least \$225 million in additional annual funding by FY 2008, at the latest.</p>	<p>Press Release: Judge Joseph H.H. Kaplan Rules in Favor of the students of Baltimore City Public School System</p> <p>Press Release: Judge Calls for "Continued Progress Towards Constitutional Adequacy" for Baltimore City School Children</p>
<p>2005</p>	<p>Court of Appeals rules <i>Bradford</i> case may continue in Circuit Court</p>	<p>The State appealed the Court’s 2004 order and its many findings and declarations. The Court of Appeals declined to hear most of the State’s appeal on the basis that the Circuit Court’s order was not final. The remainder of the appeal concerned the \$58 million BCPSS budget deficit, and the Court of Appeals reversed a specific injunction regarding the budget deficit. Accordingly, the rest of the case remains under the authority of the Circuit Court until it reaches a final judgment.</p>	<p>Appellate Filing, Opinion</p> <p>Press Release: Dr. Thornton, State, and National Groups Join City Parents in Court</p> <p>Press Release: Baltimore City Parents and Students Ask State's Highest Court to Uphold Education Funding Decision</p> <p>Press Release: ACLU/Bradford Plaintiffs Statement on Court of Appeals 6-9-05 Ruling</p>
<p>2007</p>	<p>Inflation Factor Cut from Education Funding Formula</p>	<p>During the economic recession, the General Assembly discontinued funding of the annual inflation factor previously provided under the Bridge Act. The result of this decision is that per pupil funding for Baltimore City schoolchildren remained relatively flat for more than a</p>	

		decade, compounding funding inadequacy and the inequity that was never fully level.	
2009	ACLU and Baltimore Education Coalition Fight Back Additional Proposed Cuts to "Thornton"	Governor proposes \$140 million reduction in state aid to public schools. ACLU and Baltimore Education Coalition mobilize BCPSS communities to act and the Governor restores the cuts using federal stimulus funding.	Education Advocate Newsletter - January 2009
2010	ACLU publishes "Buildings for Academic Excellence: A Vision and Options to Address Deficient School Facilities in Baltimore City."	ACLU publishes groundbreaking report urging action plan to modernize BCPSS buildings.	Press Release: ACLU Report Urges Action Plan to Modernize Baltimore City School Buildings ACLU Report: Buildings for Academic Excellence
2011	ACLU and Baltimore Education Coalition launch school building modernization campaign	ACLU and Baltimore Education Coalition launch "Transform Baltimore: Build Schools, Build Neighborhoods" campaign and urge local and state officials to adopt ACLU's financing model to establish a large-scale school building modernization initiative.	Education Advocate Newsletter - August 2011
2013	Maryland legislature passes ACLU's financing model to begin the rebuilding of Baltimore City's deteriorating school buildings	ACLU and the Baltimore Education Coalition, along with BCPSS' board and staff and the mayor's office work together to pass the "Baltimore City School Construction and Revitalization Act of 2013," now called the "21st Century School Buildings" program. The bill is estimated to provide \$1 billion to fully renovate or rebuild up to 28 schools.	Press Release: Baltimore City Takes Historic First Step to Rebuild All City Schools Press Release: ACLU Lauds Passage of the \$1 Billion Baltimore City School Construction Bill

			Baltimore City 21st Century Schools History
2014	Report shows Baltimore City schools still underfunded by millions of dollars	The State’s Department of Legislative Services (DLS) reports that BCPSS was underfunded by \$1,952 per pupil for FY 2013. That amounts to underfunding Baltimore schools by approximately \$154 million.	Legislative Handbook Series - Volume IX (Page 64)
2015	Governor Hogan Cuts Thornton Funding Despite Strong Community Pushback	<p>Governor Hogan cuts \$150 million in the proposed FY 2016 budget.</p> <p>The ACLU and Baltimore Education Coalition advocate for the full restoration of the inflation factor and the Geographic Cost of Education Index (GCEI), which provides additional for districts with above average education costs.</p> <p>The legislature restores inflation and allocates the amount needed to restore GCEI (approximately \$68 million). However, the GCEI allocation required a supplemental budget from the Governor, which never came.</p>	<p>Press Release: Mayor, Baltimore Schools CEO, Del. McIntosh to Join Coalition to Call for School Funding</p> <p>Education Advocate Newsletter - November 2015</p>
2016	State Releases Education Funding Adequacy Study and Report	<p>Maryland State Department of Education research consultants, Augenblick, Palaich and Associates (APA), issue their final report on the adequacy of the State education funding formula, finding a gap of \$358 million gap for BCPSS, and \$2.9 billion statewide.</p> <p>DLS reports a \$290 million adequacy gap for BCPSS for FY 2015.</p> <p>ACLU advocates for changes and new priorities in the revision of State's education funding formula.</p>	<p>Press Release: Maryland Children Need Additional \$2.6 Billion for Adequate Education</p> <p>Fact Sheet: Realizing an Equitable Education Funding Formula for Maryland</p> <p>Adequacy of Education Funding in Maryland - Department of Legislative Services, December 8, 2016</p>
2016	“Kirwan” Commission Revisits	Commission on Innovation and Excellence in Education (or “Kirwan” Commission), established by state legislation, convenes to review APA recommendations, and	

	Funding Formula	make improvements to the statewide education funding formula. Instead of building off APA's proposal on funding adequacy, the Commission decided to adopt the National Center on Education and the Economy's (NCEE) framework that focuses on college and career readiness.	
2017	ACLU Leads Campaign to Address City Schools' \$130 Million Budget Deficit	After CEO of BCPSS, Dr. Sonja Santelises, announces a \$130 million budget deficit and projects significant teacher layoffs, the ACLU and Baltimore Education Coalition launch the "Fix the Gap" campaign to secure stop gap funding until the anticipated "Kirwan" bill is passed. The campaign brought over 2,000 Baltimore advocates to Annapolis and secured a \$180 million multi-year deal to prevent major layoffs.	<p>Press Release: BEC Stresses Urgent Need to Fix City Schools' \$130 Million Gap to Mayor Pugh and Governor Hogan</p> <p>Press Release: Baltimore Education Coalition Statement on Mayor Pugh, Del. McIntosh Presentation on Fixing City Schools' Budget Gap</p> <p>Fix the Gap: Baltimore City Public Schools</p>
2017	DLS report reveals BCPSS underfunded by \$342 million	DLS reports that BCPSS was underfunded by an estimated \$342 million in FY 2017.	Adequacy of Education Funding in Maryland Since 2002 - Department of Legislative Services, July 24, 2019
2017-18	Rebuilt and Renovated Schools Open in Baltimore	An unprecedented 10 fully modernized and rebuilt school opened during 2017-2018 under the 21st Century Buildings Program.	<p>Video: Schools that Baltimore City Students Deserve</p> <p>Press Release: An Unprecedented Six New Schools Opening in Baltimore This Week</p>
2018	ACLU Urges "Kirwan" Commission to Ensure State Education Funding	ACLU urges the "Kirwan" Commission to hire Dr. Ivory Toldson as a race equity expert to inform the Commission's work. ACLU advocates for full funding to address racial disparities and culturally responsive approaches to teaching and	Letter: To Maryland Commission on Innovation and Excellence in Education regarding recommendations for Analysis, Strategies,

	Formula is Race Equitable	delivering services to BCPSS schoolchildren.	and the Integration of Racial Equity into all Levels of Education Services Blog: Race Equity Must Be a Key Priority for the Kirwan Commission Press Release: Race Equity Expert Delivers Highly Anticipated Second Address to "Kirwan" Commission on What Students of Color Need to Succeed
2018	"Kirwan" Commission Delays Final Report	The "Kirwan" Commission releases its preliminary report and postpones release of the final report to 2019.	Maryland Commission on Innovation & Excellence in Education - Preliminary Report, January 2018 Blog: Who Are the Kirwan Commissioners? OpEd: Increasing education funding is not a luxury Kirwan: Maryland's Commission on Innovation and Excellence in Education
2019	Bradford Plaintiffs submit Letter to Governor Hogan	In a January 22, 2019, letter to Governor Hogan on behalf of concerned parents and families, the ACLU and the NAACP Legal Defense and Educational Fund, Inc. expressed grave concern that that the State was not addressing either the massive gap between current and constitutionally adequate educational funding or the immediate infrastructure needs of Baltimore City's aging school buildings.	Press Release: Concerned Parents and Civil Rights Organizations Call on the State of Maryland to Provide More Education Funding for Baltimore Schools and Investment in Children of Color

		The letter calls on the State to address this pivotal racial equity issue and ensure it fulfills its constitutional duty to students in Baltimore City.	
2019	General Assembly "Jump Starts" Blueprint	The Legislature passes SB1030, which includes programmatic priorities of the Blueprint as recommended by the “Kirwan” Commission. The bill includes \$255 million for FY 2020, and \$355 million for FY 2021 to support special education, schools with high concentrations of poverty, tutoring services, teacher salaries, and prekindergarten for all 24 school districts in Maryland. Baltimore City receives an average of \$60 million annually through SB1030.	Maryland General Assembly – The Blueprint for Maryland’s Future (SB 1030)
2019	Bradford Plaintiffs Return to Court	On March 7, 2019, the ACLU and LDF, on behalf of a group of concerned parents and civil rights organizations, filed a Petition for Further Relief in the <i>Bradford</i> litigation. The Petition seeks to hold the State accountable for its failure to provide the necessary funding for a quality education and to address the abysmal physical conditions of school facilities.	Press Release: Concerned Parents, Civil Rights Groups Sue State of Maryland Over Constitutionally Inadequate Funding for Children in Baltimore Schools Blog and Video: Students in Baltimore Also Have Dreams
2019	Case Receives Key Vote of Support from Elected Leaders	The Baltimore City Council voted on April 29, 2019, to pass a resolution supporting the <i>Bradford</i> Petition.	Press Release: Baltimore City Council Passes Resolution Supporting Suit Against Maryland State Board of Education Over Constitutionally Inadequate Funding for Baltimore Schools
2019	Celebrating Baltimore City’s New Schools	In August 2019, families and community members gathered for another round of school ribbon cutting celebrations in Baltimore City. Renovations and new buildings continue because of the ACLU's “Buildings for Academic Excellence” report and the resulting advocacy and legislative success.	Blog: Celebrating Baltimore City's New Schools

<p>2019</p>	<p><i>Bradford</i> Plaintiffs submit letter to the “Kirwan” Commission</p>	<p>On October 15, 2019, the <i>Bradford</i> team wrote to members of the “Kirwan” Commission urging them to address racial and wealth funding inequities directly and fully.</p>	<p>Press Release: Legal Team Representing Parents and Students in Baltimore Urge Kirwan Commission to Address Systemic Underfunding</p>
<p>2019</p>	<p>Baltimore #FundOurSchools Parent Town Hall</p>	<p>The <i>Bradford</i> team partners with local advocacy and community groups for the first of a series of public town hall meetings to update parents and the public about the case and discuss other pressing education issues.</p>	<p>Event: Baltimore #FundOurSchools Parent Town Hall</p>
<p>2019</p>	<p>“Kirwan” Commission Releases Interim Report</p>	<p>“Kirwan” Commission releases interim report but delays final report for a second year. The interim report provides recommendations to lawmakers on jump starting certain programs in the Blueprint plan for the 2019 legislative session and provides projections for a new state education funding formula.</p> <p>ACLU voices concerns and advocates for a fix for Baltimore City's unfair and inequitable local contribution requirement under the proposed changes to the formula.</p>	<p>Maryland Commission on Innovation & Excellence in Education - Interim Report, January 2019</p>
<p>2020</p>	<p>Circuit Court for Baltimore City rejects attempt by the State of Maryland to dismiss <i>Bradford</i> case</p>	<p>On January 21, 2020, the Circuit Court for Baltimore City rejected an attempt by the State to dismiss <i>Bradford v. Maryland State Board of Education</i>. Not only does this decision uphold the continued importance of the consent decree in the case and the Court’s previous rulings, but it underscores the right of the Maryland Judiciary to protect the constitutional requirement that the State provide children an adequate education. Judge Audrey Carrion rejected the State’s argument that such issues present “a political question” that Maryland judges are powerless to address. Judge Carrion further ruled that the families’ requests for equitable relief are not subject to statutes of limitations, but even if they were, advocates’ diligence in fighting for</p>	<p>Press Release: Statement on Today's Latest Victory in the <i>Bradford</i> Case Championing State Constitutional Right to Education</p>

		children for nearly two decades makes the petition timely.	
2020	Change Starts with Our Children	Another three new schools under 21st Century School Buildings Program open.	Blog: Change Starts with Our Children
2020	Blueprint for Maryland's Future or "Kirwan" bill is Introduced	<p>On February 7, 2020, the legislature introduces the Blueprint for Maryland's Future, or "Kirwan" bill.</p> <p>On February 17, 2020, the ACLU testifies before House and Senate Committees to advocate for improvements to the proposed formula in the bill. The ACLU successfully champions an amendment to provide additional state funding to BCPSS and other low wealth districts and reduce the amount required by the local government. However, ACLU's request for an adequacy analysis of the "Kirwan" formula does not pass. The State also does not amend the bill to include strong language on racially and culturally responsive approaches to teaching, learning, and service delivery.</p> <p>The final Blueprint bill passes on March 17, 2020, and includes a new funding stream for schools with concentrated poverty — a decade-old ACLU priority. The bill phases in an estimated \$3.4 billion by FY 2030 statewide, including approximately \$750 million for BCPSS.</p>	<p>Testimony: Interagency Commission on School Construction - School Facilities Funding Formula and Statewide Building Assessment, September 12, 2019</p> <p>Blueprint for Maryland's Future – Focus the Formula</p> <p>Maryland General Assembly - Blueprint for Maryland's Future - Implementation (HB 1300)</p> <p>Maryland General Assembly - Blueprint for Maryland's Future - Implementation (HB 1300)</p>
2020	ACLU and Bradford legal team responds to Governor Hogan's veto	<p>Governor Hogan vetoes the Blueprint bill on May 7, 2020. Governor Hogan also vetoes the Built to Learn bill, which would increase funds for school rebuilding and renovation.</p> <p>Given the generational impact of constitutionally inadequate funding, the ACLU and <i>Bradford</i> legal team urged the legislature to override the Governor's veto of the Blueprint bill and prioritize phase-in of new education dollars to those districts with the largest adequacy gaps.</p>	Press Release: State Legislature Must Override Governor Hogan's Veto of the Blueprint Bill to Protect Students' Constitutional Right to Education
2020	Bradford team hosts	The <i>Bradford</i> team partners with local advocacy and community groups for the	Event: Baltimore City: Our Children's

	Virtual Town Hall – “Baltimore City: Our Children’s Education Matters”	second of a series of public town hall meetings to update parents and the public about the case and discuss other pressing education issues.	Education Matters - Virtual Town Hall Video: Baltimore City: Our Children’s Education Matters Town hall
2020	Bradford team hosts Virtual Town Hall “Are Baltimore City Schools on a Path Towards Equity?”	The Bradford team partners with local advocacy and community groups for the third of a series of public town hall meetings to update parents and the public about the case and discuss other pressing education issues.	Event: Are Baltimore City Schools on a Path Towards Equity? (Virtual Town Hall) Video: Are Baltimore City schools on a path towards equity?
2020	“Kirwan” Commission Releases Final Report	“Kirwan” Commission releases final report.	Maryland Commission on Innovation & Excellence in Education, Blueprint for Maryland's Future - Final Report, December 2020
2020	Bradford team sends letter sent to Governor Hogan, Senate President Bill Ferguson, and House Speaker Adrienne Jones	On December 15, 2020, the <i>Bradford</i> legal team hosted a press conference with advocates in support of a letter sent the day before by parents of students attending public schools in Baltimore City to Governor Larry Hogan, Senate President Bill Ferguson, and House Speaker Adrienne Jones. The advocates urged State leaders to act now and take specific steps to support the students’ right to an education and fulfill the state’s responsibility under the Maryland Constitution and binding court orders.	Press Release: Baltimore Right to Education Legal Team Pushes Governor, State Leaders to Support Students' Right to an Education
2021	General Assembly Overrides Governor’s Veto	On February 12, 2021, the General Assembly overrides the Governor’s veto of HB1300 - Blueprint for Maryland's Future bill.	
2021	\$3.8 Billion Education Reform Bill, the Blueprint for Maryland’s	The ACLU worked to increase funding amounts to the districts with the largest adequacy gaps in the early years of phase-in and for additional funding to address the digital divide, much of which was incorporated into the final bill. The ACLU	Event: Town Hall: Equity for Students Now! 2021 General Assembly Report

	Future, Passes	<p>also asked again for an adequacy analysis, which was denied.</p> <p>On March 1, the legislature filed HB1372 - Blueprint for Maryland's Future - Revisions to make improvements to the original bill.</p> <p>Recent State funding analyses show that the Blueprint projects a total of \$3.8 billion increase in State funding for education statewide by FY 2034. The bill also requires local governments to provide an estimated \$703 million more to their school districts over this time.</p>	<p>Maryland General Assembly - Blueprint for Maryland's Future - Revisions (HB 1372)</p> <p>Blueprint for Maryland's Future – Chapters 36 and 55 of 2021, Updated Fiscal Note Appendices - Department of Legislative Services</p>
2021	\$2.2 Billion Statewide School Construction Bill Passes	<p>Modeled after the ACLU's financing strategy for the 21st Century School Buildings Program, the state legislature passed the Built to Learn Act. The bill provides funding to school districts statewide, including \$420 million to expand Baltimore City's 21st Century School Buildings Program to 6-8 more schools. Notwithstanding this increase in funds, approximately 90 BCPSS school buildings are still in poor condition with no guarantee of funding.</p>	<p>Maryland Public School Construction - The Built to Learn Act</p>
2021	State again tries to dismiss Bradford litigation	<p>In November 2021, the State filed a second motion to dismiss the <i>Bradford</i> Plaintiffs' Petition for Further Relief, repeating the same arguments that were previously rejected by the Court.</p>	
2022	ACLU and Allies Take Action to Demand Governor Hogan Restore Funding Omitted in His Proposed Budget	<p>Nearly \$130 million— \$100 million of which was intended for Baltimore schools — included in the Blueprint law was omitted in the Governor's proposed budget for FY 2023. The ACLU and the Maryland Alliance for Race Equity in Education acted to successfully urge the Governor to restore these cuts in a supplemental budget.</p>	<p>Press Release: Race Equity Coalition Urges Governor to Restore Cuts to Education: \$140 Million Denied for Black and Brown Children</p>
2022	21st Century School Buildings	<p>To date, 24 of the 28 schools planned for the first phase of the 21st Century School Buildings Program have been fully rebuilt</p>	<p>Blog: Celebrating Baltimore City's New Schools</p>

	Program continues to open newly rebuilt schools	and are occupied by students. The four remaining schools are undergoing construction, and another 6-8 high schools funded by the Built to Learn Act are currently going through the feasibility study and design processes.	
2022	Court denies State's second motion to dismiss.	The Court cursorily denies the State's second motion to dismiss on March 7, 2022.	Order: State's second motion to dismiss and motion to strike denied
2022	Court of Special Appeals rejects State's efforts to stop Bradford litigation	The State filed a notice to appeal the March decision, and to stop the trial court proceedings. The Court of Special Appeals granted <i>Bradford</i> Plaintiffs' motion to dismiss the State's appeal on May 11, 2022.	Order: Motion to dismiss the State's appeal granted
2022	Maryland's highest court rejects State's efforts to stop Bradford litigation	The State then petitioned the Court of Appeals for a writ of certiorari. <i>Bradford</i> Plaintiffs opposed and that petition was denied on July 8, 2022, allowing the case to continue.	Order: Motion to stay denied
2022	Bradford Plaintiffs file a Motion for Summary Judgment	On August 12, 2022, the <i>Bradford</i> Plaintiffs and the State filed motions for summary judgment. Plaintiffs argued that there is no dispute as to the facts that BCPSS has been underfunded for decades, underfunding negatively impacts student achievement, and the underperformance of students in the district is caused by the State's failure to provide constitutionally adequate funding. Plaintiffs filed a brief in opposition to the State's arguments on October 4, 2022. Both parties filed reply briefs on October 31, 2022.	Memorandum of Law Opposition to motion for summary judgment Reply motion for summary judgment
2022	Court hears oral argument in	On December 14, 2022, Judge Audrey Carrion of the Circuit Court for Baltimore City held an all-day oral argument about the merits of the <i>Bradford</i> Plaintiffs case.	

	<i>Bradford</i> litigation		
2023	<i>Bradford</i> Plaintiffs file Proposed Conclusions of Law	The <i>Bradford</i> Plaintiffs filed their Proposed Conclusions of Law explaining why the Court should find the State has violated its constitutional obligations and order a remedy.	Plaintiffs' Proposed Conclusions of Law
2023	Court grants State's motion, rejecting <i>Bradford</i> Plaintiffs' claims	<p>On March 3, 2023, the Court granted the State's motion for summary judgment, ruling against the <i>Bradford</i> Plaintiffs. In a decision that conflicts with the Court's prior decisions in this litigation, the Court held that the issue of appropriating funding for schools is a "political question" to be decided solely by the state legislature. This contradicts the Court's previous decisions in this litigation where it declared that the State's severe underfunding of Baltimore City Public Schools violated the Maryland Constitution and prompted more funding to the school system.</p> <p>In contrast to its prior orders requiring an "education that is adequate by contemporary educational standards," the Court held that the Constitution "only requires an effort by the State to at most provide a basic education." And, despite hundreds of pages of evidence showing significant underfunding in BCPSS and its negative effect on student learning, the Court held that the students were receiving a "basic" education.</p>	Press Release: Circuit Court Decision Finds, Despite Evidence of Chronic Underfunding, Baltimore City Public Schools Receives "Constitutionally Adequate" Funding from State of Maryland